



## **BEFS WORKSHOP REPORT**

### **SCOTTISH HISTORIC ENVIRONMENT POLICY 1 – SCOTLAND'S HISTORIC ENVIRONMENT**

#### **INTRODUCTION**

The workshop took place on Friday 28 April 2006 and was attended by 23 individuals representing interests within the historic environment sector. The purpose of the workshop was to gather views directly from stakeholders within the historic environment sector on the content of the draft policy.

#### **PRESENTATION**

Gordon Barclay, Head of National Policy at Historic Scotland, presented the consultation document. The following key points were made:

- The SHEP series has arisen from one of the recommendations made as a result of the Review of Historic Scotland in 2002, which stressed the need for greater transparency in operations and stronger partnership working. Other recommendations that have already been achieved are the appointment of three non-executive directors to the Board of Historic Scotland and the merging of the two Inspectorates.
- The Review recommended that a strategic policy for the historic environment be developed and that strategic and operational policies be developed with wide stakeholder engagement. The SHEP series responds to this recommendation by stating strategic policy.
- To make clear the distinction between strategic and operational policies: strategic policies have ministerial endorsement; operational policies are signed off by the Chief Executive of Historic Scotland and describe how the agency will deliver on the strategic policy.
- SHEP 1 sits above the subsequent SHEPs. SHEP 2 covers scheduling and has been published in final form (previous stakeholder engagement took place in 2004); SHEP 3 is out for consultation alongside SHEP 1 and covers gardens and designed landscapes. Further SHEPs to be published in 2006 will cover: Scheduled Monument Consent; Listing; Listed Building Consent; Battlefields. Further SHEPs will cover the marine historic environment; conservation areas; cultural landscapes; properties in care (2 documents covering acquisition and access). All SHEPs will be issued for public consultation.
- Operational Policies: an Operational Policy on Volunteering is already out for consultation. Not all Operational Policies will be issued for public consultation – a number will be subject to consultation involving just key stakeholders.

- A key objective in developing this suite of strategic and operational policies is to tease out strategic policy from detailed operational guidance.
- It is intended that the SHEP series should be used in Public Inquiry to help make the case for the historic environment.
- SHEP 1 sets out the Minister's aims for the historic environment. These aims are:-
  - a) To realise the historic environment's full potential as an economic, educational and cultural resource across every part of Scotland and by the widest range of people;
  - b) To maximise the role of the historic environment in achieving the wider aims of social and economic regeneration;
  - c) To identify what forms our historic environment and protect and manage it in a sustainable way to guarantee its long-term survival, ensuring that we fully understand its component parts, their condition and relationships;
  - d) To break down the intellectual and physical barriers to its wider accessibility.

## QUESTIONS

A series of questions covered the following areas:

- The relationship between SHEP1 and the Stirling Charter – clarification required.
- How SHEPs relate to the Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas – and their status in Public Inquiries – needs to be made clear in the documents. In response it was noted that the *Memorandum of Guidance* does not make the distinction between the operational and strategic policy types. While the SHEPs will eventually supersede the Memorandum, the substance of the Memorandum will remain material until such time as the SHEP identifies that section of the *Memorandum* which it supersedes. Also the SHEP series will supersede elements of existing guidance and that this will be made clear – for example SHEP 2 supersedes part of PAN 42.
- Level of linkage between sustainability agenda and the SHEPs – this should be strengthened. In response it was noted that the intention behind the SHEPs is that a 'green thread' runs throughout, and that 'Passed to the Future' will be revised.
- SHEPs should enable continuity of use of the historic environment and be sufficiently robust to guard against inappropriate development.
- It was suggested that there be a SHEP on regeneration.
- The statutory powers of Historic Scotland and their ability to enter into Management Agreements were raised. In response it was noted that HEACS is currently examining the heritage legislation in Scotland. The Planning Bill does not cover Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas.
- Some concern was raised over the extent to which the tenor of the SHEP did not achieve a balance between care of the historic asset and its exploitation.

## KEY POINTS MADE IN BREAK OUT DISCUSSION GROUPS

### General comments

- The consultation document was welcomed.
- Historic Scotland's commitment to improved communication with stakeholders and the wider public was welcomed. It's commitment to the use of a wider range of medium eg web-sites, special debates etc should be promoted.
- The three outcomes were considered appropriate in themselves and were welcomed, but could be expanded to include more, or broken down for more clarity (outcome 1 being the HS priority, and the others having a quite different status).
- Participants queried whether the outcomes will be measured.
- Participants sought clarity on the target audience for the document.
- It was stressed that this document must have the endorsement of all Scottish Ministers.
- The document is currently very narrowly focussed in terms of partnership.
- Within the Scottish Ministers' aims it should be recognised that the historic environment can play a role in *preventing* degeneration within places valued by communities in addition to its value in *achieving* regeneration.
- An overarching sustainability statement could be included within the vision, running through the subsequent policies.

### Purpose of SHEP 1

- Participants would like to see more clarity on whether the document is setting out a Vision or describing current activity.
- Participants would like to see more aspiration and leadership in the document.
- Participants considered that the necessarily regulatory nature of the management process be given a higher profile, so that people understood that control had to be part of the picture
- The document should have broad ownership; currently the document is very much Historic Scotland focussed. It must be a document with wider Scottish Executive endorsement – a document coming from the Scottish Ministers. Accordingly it should set out a vision for all in the sector not just Historic Scotland.
- It was recognised that SHEP 1 will be useful in relating the interests of the historic environment sector to other broad policy agenda. It should help Historic Scotland and the Minister make the case for the historic environment with other SE departments. This will be necessary if it is to engage a wider audience.
- The document should stress the role of other organisations within the sector and the significant role played by volunteers and professionals. It should encourage all bodies involved in the historic environment to produce their own Operational Plan.
- It is at the local level that the historic environment has particular significance and value for local communities – this document should be relevant and useful tool at this level.

- The document could give an overview of the problems currently experienced within the Historic Environment and how these problems can be overcome.
- Participants would like to see a more direct style – a change of emphasis to be more explicit (particularly if the document is to have value/use in public inquiries). This will help achieve 'buy in' for the historic environment at the most strategic level.
- SHEP1 needs to be clearer about how it will relate to subsequent SHEPs and also the Operational Policies. Need to make a stronger link between the aspirations given in SHEP 1 and implementation. It was suggested that a diagram be included in SHEP 1 showing its position relating to subsequent documents and also the broader legislative context (eg reference the European Landscape Convention, Passed to the Future etc).
- This strategic policy should address the 'changing' world. It will be necessary to anticipate what policy will have to engage with in the future eg the natural environment, farming, green issues.

**Key Outcome 1: The historic environment is cared for, protected and enhanced for the benefit of our own and future generations.**

- The document must be clear when it is referring to the designated parts of the historic environment, and when it is referring to the whole historic environment. The policy protection for the majority of the historic environment which is not designated is limited; this document therefore needs to give some form of endorsement at the most strategic level of the value of this wider historic environment. This distinction is important and needs to be explicitly stated in the document (reference could be made to the European Landscape Convention which applies to townscapes as well as landscapes).
- It was suggested that it should include a statement or summary of what we have presently.
- Participants would like to see the document convey a stronger vision for achieving successful places – taking a holistic, area-based perspective rather than focussing solely on designated assets. This would assist local authority officers in advocating the value of place rather than particular site.
- Participants highlighted the issue of cumulative development in conservation areas – for example through the installation of uPVC double glazing. This document should be able to relate the value of the historic environment to other policy agenda such as energy efficiency.

**Key Outcome 2: There is increased public appreciation and enjoyment of the historic environment amongst all the people of Scotland and visitors to the country.**

- Again the focus should be on the collective efforts of those working within the historic environment sector at all levels – this is particularly relevant to outreach and education work where much activity takes place at the local level and by many different organisations including many volunteers. The document should be useful at the local level and encourage local stewardship.
- It was suggested that the list of particular initiatives/projects (at 7.5) be removed and that a more generalised, inclusive approach be taken in highlighting activity relating to access/education etc.
- Participants would like to see the historic environment more strongly embedded into the curriculum (there are conspicuous gaps).

- The document could engage wider interest in the historic environment through reference to participation projects for the wider public and young people in particular.
- The document should refer to other key players against this outcome for example: A+DS, Learning Teaching Scotland, Visit Scotland.

**Key Outcome 3: The historic environment's importance as a key asset in Scotland's economic, social and cultural success is recognised and skilfully harnessed.**

- It was suggested that the word 'economic' be removed from the chapter title "Releasing the full economic potential".
- It was suggested that 'quality of life' value at a local level be expanded upon.
- This outcome should relate the historic environment more strongly to other Executive agenda; eg health, farming, energy, waste, wider environmental aspects.

**PARTICIPATING ORGANISATIONS**

Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland  
 The Council for Scottish Archaeology  
 Edinburgh World Heritage  
 Glasgow City Council  
 Historic Scotland  
 Institute of Field Archaeologists – Scottish Group  
 Institute of Historic Building Conservation – Scottish Branch  
 National Trust for Scotland  
 Natural Stone Institute  
 RCAHMS  
 Royal Town Planning Institute in Scotland  
 Rural Scotland  
 Scottish Civic Trust  
 Scottish Stone Liaison Group  
 Society of Antiquaries of Scotland  
 Strathclyde Building Preservation Trust