

Historic Environment Working Group (HEWG)

Meeting Note 22nd February 2024

Topic: HEWG

Time: 10am – 12pm

Date: 22/02/2024

Venue: Online

See BEFS [HEWG page](#) for past papers.

Chair: Ian Baxter

BEFS attendees: Ailsa Macfarlane, Hazel Johnson, Jonna Meredith, Malini Chakrabarty

1. Welcome, Introductions and Apologies

Apologies:

Ann Packard - RSA-MCICH

Gavin MacGregor - AS

Sean O'Reilly - IHBC

Diane Gray - NLHF

Judy Riley - SGDL

Attendees:

Bill Pagan, CDT

Catriona Melville, NLHF

Diarmid Hearn, NTS

DJ Johnston-Smith, SCT

Douglas Campbell, IHBC

Euan Leitch, SURF

Jenny Devine, RTP1

Jo Robertson, AHF

Jocelyn Cunliffe, AHSS

Joe Traynor, SCivT

John Lawson, ALGAO

Judith Roebuck, CoS

Lindsay Lennie, SCHAT

Scott McGibbon, PVOTAL

Simon Gilmour, SoAS

Welcome to Malini Chakrabarty

2. Agree [previous meeting note](#) (available online) – all necessary actions completed, or to be updated on in BEFS Sector updates.
3. BEFS Sector Updates and Policy Updates – led by BEFS

Historic Environment Working Group (HEWG)

Meeting Note 22nd February 2024

- BEFS celebrated 20 years this year, held BEFS Connects, an event to review the strategic challenges and successes of the past two decades and bringing together Members and the wider sector to network and connect.
- BEFS and SPAB hosted event in Glasgow on 29 November: Places of Worship - Churches in Transition, Planning for the Future. This event brought together the BEFS working groups POWF and COG, as well as inviting attendance from the wider sector.
- BEFS Director gave evidence to the Constitution External Affairs and Culture Committee in relation to Our Past, Our Future, and the Culture Budget. This session also included BEFS Members, NTS, NLHF, AHSS as well as Museums Galleries Scotland and SDS. A full briefing paper was issued to the Committee clerks prior to attendance.
- Historic Environment Scotland have launched their [search for a new CEO](#). They are seeking an ambitious, inspirational, and transformational leader who will embed a culture of innovation, enterprise, and teamwork. There have been reappointments of Terry Levinthal, Andrew Davis, and Emma Herd as [members of the Historic Environment Scotland board](#).

Our Past, Our Future delivery - SHEF event update

- Hosted by Historic Environment Scotland and the Scottish Government on behalf of Scottish Ministers, the Scottish Historic Environment Forum (SHEF) took place in Stirling last week, bringing together over 100 representatives from across the sector to explore next steps for and delivery of Scotland's Strategy for the Historic Environment, [Our Past Our Future](#). BEFS director, Ailsa Macfarlane was invited to speak and presented an overview of how delivery of the strategy can be fully integrated within the wider policy landscape, and the opportunities that this presents for sector advocacy. Look out for BEFS producing a graphic of inter-related policies shortly!

Tenement Working Group update

- SLC Mandatory owners' associations. Parliamentary event 1st May, report out for consultation. Ongoing support for the Tenement Maintenance Working Group. BEFS and Under One Roof provide secretariat for the Tenement Working Group. Sub working groups have been meeting regularly. Findings and recommendations of these groups to be presented at next Working Group in Jan 2024. BEFS website for this work has recently been updated to reflect new activity.

Policy Consultations

CONSULTATION ON DEVOLVING POWERS FOR A SCOTTISH BUILDING SAFETY LEVY (19/02/24)

BEFS supports the principle of a levy but would urge that any such legislation must take full cognisance of other existing and nascent Scottish legislation to ensure a coherent approach across the wider policy landscape. BEFS Members would anticipate that any associated challenges and

Historic Environment Working Group (HEWG)

Meeting Note 22nd February 2024

unforeseen consequences of a levy would be addressed during consultation on the detail of the levy, once this power had been devolved.

WELLBEING AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT (SCOTLAND) BILL (14/02/24)

BEFS welcomes work towards definitions of 'wellbeing' and 'sustainable development' that provide clarity and enable a coherent approach to delivering Scotland's National Outcomes. BEFS response highlights the need for greater understanding of the important role that heritage and the historic environment have to play in both these areas.

BUILDINGS STANDARDS ENFORCEMENT AND SANCTIONS (22/01/24)

BEFS is broadly supportive of measures designed to give greater clarity around enforcement and to increase powers and recourse for stretched and under resourced Local Authorities. However, we would urge that across the wider policy landscape, a consistent framework is essential; clear and transparent measures must be supported by joined up legislation across Building Standards, the National Planning Framework 4 (NPF4) and any related legislative consultations.

AMBITIONS FOR THE PLANNING SYSTEM (01/12/23)

BEFS considers a key and impactful outcome of the planning system is a holistic understanding of what makes good places for people and communities. The response highlights the need for the appropriate skills and training within planning teams to enable appropriate consideration of the needs of communities and an understanding of the value and contribution of historic and existing buildings as assets towards outcomes set within NPF4 and Scotland's National Outcomes.

STATEMENT IN RELATION TO THE CALL FOR VIEWS: AGRICULTURE AND RURAL COMMUNITIES (SCOTLAND) BILL (24/11/23)

BEFS comments reiterate previous statements that 'the environment' should be considered to include the natural and historic environment. Power to provide support in relation to historic and cultural sites is an excellent start, however further integration within the Bill could elicit greater benefits more broadly.

Open Consultations

National Parks in Scotland

Scottish Government

The Scottish Government invites individuals, communities, and organisations to develop and submit formal nominations for their area to become Scotland's next National Park.

Closes 29 February 2024

Managing Change Underwater Heritage

Historic Environment Scotland

Views are being sought on the draft Managing Change guidance on Underwater Heritage.

Historic Environment Working Group (HEWG)

Meeting Note 22nd February 2024

The aim of this guidance is to be a practical guide on increasing the understanding of underwater heritage along with identifying and managing the impacts of change in underwater heritage, while protecting the cultural significance of these issues. The new Underwater Heritage guidance will be part of the [Managing Change in the Historic Environment guidance series](#). This guidance will be relevant to underwater marine planning, including work on the new [National Marine Plan 2](#).

Closes 5 March 2024

Home Energy Model: replacement for the Standard Assessment Procedure (SAP)

UK Government

The Standard Assessment Procedure (SAP) is the methodology currently used by the government to estimate the energy performance of homes across the United Kingdom. The Home Energy Model will replace the SAP for the energy rating of dwellings. This is a consultation on the Model while it is still at a formative stage, so that industry can participate in the development process.

Closes 6 March 2024

Social Housing Net Zero Standard in Scotland

Scottish Government

The social housing sector has led the way on energy efficiency in recent years and is well placed to build on this further while building in longer term ambition to transition to clean heating. This consultation seeks views on a new Social Housing Net Zero Standard (SHNZS) in Scotland. This new standard will replace the second Energy Efficiency Standard for Social Housing (EESH2).

Closes 8 March 2024

Proposals for a Heat in Buildings Bill

Scottish Government

There is no way to meet a legal obligation to reach 'net zero' without changing the heating systems in most buildings. The purpose of this consultation is to make everyone aware of the proposal to make new laws around the heating systems that can be used in homes and places of work, and to invite views on those proposals.

Closes 8 March 2024

Scotland's draft Circular Economy and Waste Route Map to 2030

Scottish Government

This consultation invites views on the proposed priorities to accelerate more sustainable use of our resources, support delivery of a circular economy to 2030, and reduce emissions associated with resources and waste. It outlines what the Scottish Government intend to do, by when, and how they will work with others, to drive sustainable use and management of our resources, and delivery of Scotland's circular economy up to 2030. The direction and actions set out in this Route Map are complemented by the Circular Economy (Scotland) Bill and its provisions.

Closes 15 March 2024

Guidance on inclusive design for town centres and busy streets

Scottish Government

Historic Environment Working Group (HEWG)

Meeting Note 22nd February 2024

When the design of town centres and busy street environments does not fully consider the needs of all members of the community, people may become excluded from these areas and the essential functions that they provide. Potential barriers to access should be removed and not included in any scheme. This draft guidance was developed in response to research which identified that street design should consider the needs of everyone and should consider all Protected Characteristics under the Equality Act 2010.

Closes 29 March 2024

Managing the Old and New Towns of Edinburgh World Heritage Site

The City of Edinburgh Council

The Old and New Towns of Edinburgh were given World Heritage Status in 1995; recognising the striking contrast and quality in architecture between the medieval Old Town and the Georgian New Town. A Management Plan identifies issues and opportunities within the World Heritage Site and sets out priority areas for action to preserve and enhance the site. While the Management Plan covers a ten-year period, an action plan is developed alongside it focusing on a two-year period. The City of Edinburgh Council would like to hear your views on the new plan, specifically whether you feel they are doing enough to protect and enhance the Site, and any other ideas or suggestions which you may have.

***NEW* Closes 8 April**

Scottish National Adaptation Plan (2024-2029)

Scottish Government

The effects of climate change are already being felt by people in Scotland. That is why, as well as taking action to reduce emissions, we must also take steps to adapt to climate change. This consultation seeks your views on the Scottish National Adaptation Plan 2024-29. The final Adaptation Plan will only be effective if it is informed by Scots' local and lived experience of climate change. During the public consultation period on this draft Adaptation Plan a formal public consultation will be opened on the Scottish Government's 'Citizen Space.' Alongside this the Scottish Government will run a series of events tailored to both delivery partners and the public, to gather a wide range of views on the policy proposals in this draft Adaptation Plan.

Closes 24 April 2024

Consultations flagged by Members:

- Intangible Cultural Heritage Consultation, DCMS
phil.foxwood@dcms.gov.uk
- Treasure Trove Review Public Consultation | KLTR
Closes 13 May 2024

4. Organisational Updates from Members

JT, SCT – My Place Ceremony Awards 13th. New categories. Community led architecture and design, photography and (NEW) child/migrants and Community Champion Award. Looking at skills so looking at traditional building skills and apprenticeships, working with

Historic Environment Working Group (HEWG)

Meeting Note 22nd February 2024

underrepresented groups in Scotland. Working with Scottish Land commission, vacant land in town centres. Active consultant in HiB consultation.

BP, CDT – Thanks for letting Cupar Development Trust be part, grass roots representation. BP has retired from board and chair.

2023 – Action plan, charette, scoping study for arts and culture hub, nearly completed its local place plan. Traditional activities for 2024, building on ICH. Community empowerment – need people and resources. Have development and admin. officer now so making progress there. But if these resources aren't there, then work doesn't happen. Cupar has been very fortunate. However, no funding past early 2025.

DC, IHBC Scot - Moving towards chartered status, consultation with membership. Expect progress once board has met later in the year. IHBC annual school in Reading 12 – 15 June. Info on IHBC website – booking open soon. Virtual element available. IHBC Scotland Branch event in Dundee 1 March plus AGM. Details and bookings:

https://events.ihbc.org.uk/?tribe_events=ihbc-scotland-branch-agm-talks-and-visits-in-dundee

CM, NLHT – Grants reopened last month for grants between 10K and 10 million. 4 new investment principles under Heritage 2033 strategy. Published new guidance and forms, and materials to help applicants and support new strategies.

LL, SCHAT – TBHC and retrofit, booked until May. Women in construction event at Stirling High School, from different schools (40 participants). Level 3 retrofit course with John Edwards, full - so hopefully running again later in the year. HES SCHAT review ongoing. Celebrating city heritage trusts turning 20, hope to have a brochure. Leading on heritage strategy for Stirling, new approach, SCHAT are coordination and will be delivered in Autumn of this year. Whole of Stirling council area, big community consultation.

DJ, SCT – Church recording budget, project ongoing. Website refresh. Published a national list of closing churches. Map at bottom of blog, (takes a few seconds to download on site) <https://www.scotlandschurchestrust.org.uk/blog/scotlands-closing-churches/>. Has had a huge response. SCT first priority is to give communities a genuine opportunity to take on their church/POW.

IB referred group to work of Places of Worship Forum. Please read more here for an overview of this group's ongoing collaborative and strategic work on the issues surrounding places of worship in transition: <https://www.befs.org.uk/policy-topics/places-of-worship-forum/>

DH Q: Is this also available as a spreadsheet? **A:** Yes.

SG noted event in St Andrews, Sacred Landscapes project:

<https://www.eventbrite.co.uk/e/sacred-landscapes-of-fife-reception-and-website-launch-tickets-798640895417?aff=oddtcreator>. Regional research will help to evidence base.

JC, AHSS – On behalf of AHSS wrote to Brian Waller CEO of General Trustees and received quick reply. Historic properties portfolio. Ask of IB – discussions with HES about PICs, any

Historic Environment Working Group (HEWG)

Meeting Note 22nd February 2024

criteria for HES taking buildings in to care? HES don't seem to want to take churches, Brechin Cathedral and St Nicholas West Kirk, Aberdeen – both outstanding and have uncertain futures. Aware that HES has said no to taking on churches, but HES could divest of some responsibility for existing PICS to take on new ones?

AHSS are replying to HiB consultation.

Currently compiling Spring Magazine.

Event - Conversation about Mavisbank House and the research work of William Kay. Excellent meeting, 90 people in the room 75 online. Landmark Trust application to National Heritage Memorial Trust fund.

IB shared HES acquisition policy. IB will raise at next meeting.

DC notes there are some advanced conversations around The West Kirk of St Nicholas.

JL, ALGAO – Concerns how the sale of churches is not allowing for recording, impacts on human remains. CEC has a consultation on Greyfriars Kirkyard. Will contribute to a Management Plan.

JR, CoS – Re the SCT map: Notes that the document is misrepresenting and exaggerating the issue. Presbytery plans are in development. Situation is bad, but not as bad as it perhaps looks when presented this way. CoS hasn't issued a list, because there isn't a final and definitive one. JR has done 14 closure visits to date, and has another dozen in diary. CoS do try to help the congregations through the difficult time. JR due to talk at Historic Religious Buildings Alliance (HRBA) specifically on closures, in London – CoE want to learn from Scotland.

Cupar Dev Trust – Cupar Old Kirk – not sure of imminent closure but the trust might be up for looking at that? And CoS is seeing more positive applications for churches, and is still appointing Building Officers for each presbytery, new appointment in Edinburgh. J McNamara has moved to Perth. The Highlands and Islands Presbytery has now been formally established.

HES were approached about possibility of taking on Brechin and St Nicholas. They are not taking on ANY new buildings.

DJ Data is caveated. SCT feels that some clarity was needed on buildings that are in the pipeline.

Secretariat note: BEFS report for CoS reflected congregations' responses, not BEFS or CoS views.

DH, NTS – Acquiring a Risk Management System, real time intelligence on condition of properties and climate change impact, connect to assets on the ground.

Digital, project to digitise assets.

Moving out of Sighthill, Edinburgh Park – back to Charlotte Square number 5. Moving away from national headquarters approach.

EL, SURF – Awards in Autumn. Events coming up in May – shared learning from work. People in Place forum – green master planning. Event 'When failure isn't failure' later in the year.

<https://surf.scot/events/> Also on failure - [FailSpace | \(failspaceproject.co.uk\)](https://failspaceproject.co.uk) .

Consultations – Working Democracy Matters 2, second stage of SG's agenda. This is picking up after stalling during covid. Message is that if democracy isn't funded it won't happen.

Historic Environment Working Group (HEWG)

Meeting Note 22nd February 2024

Perspective within multiple crisis: £2.5 Million slashed from affordable homes budget. Rents looking to go up to find 1 billion. People are suffering in current economic crisis. Life expectancy in Glasgow... Message relevant to this group that Heritage can help with this re homes etc.

BP Q: If LCC were operating properly wouldn't need a LDT. Kick to local democracy is in results, in day to day terms to find something to get them interested.

EL A: Re LPP, it is very interesting Kinning Park and Westerhailes did LPP, many of the LPPs are being picked up better resourced who re accessing and picking them up. But there is a need for them to be done in conjunction with community action plan to access windfarm money. E.g. there is windfarm money in Girvan, but it can't go to Girvan unless there is an overarching body working for it, SURF helping with this.

JD, RTPI – Events and communications manager Jenny Stansfield has retired. Down to team of three currently! Role will be advertised on website by end of week.

Entries for Planning Excellence Award are still open. Closing date is 15th of March: [RTPI | RTPI Awards for Planning Excellence - celebrating planning](#)

Policy – responded to proposed Wellbeing and Sustainable Development Bill – a busy time for consultations!

EL Is getting a sense that people are responding to planning negatively as an outlet for other aspects that they don't have control over. **EL and LD to meet to discuss.**

JL Agrees, seen as a planning authority – CEC planning get everything. People see everything as a planning issue.

JR, AHF – Could also talk at length about churches, groups are going to AHF to look for funding and advice. Projects – what is the community need and what is the plan? LPP can be hugely useful.

Funding of Heritage Development Trusts, started in Dec – funding secured from NLHF which made awards to 12 trusts across UK, 3 of these in Scotland. At end of 3 year period the trust has had the opportunity to work towards a more sustainable footing. Approach is a multi-building one, with a place focus. [Heritage Development Trusts | The Architectural Heritage Fund \(ahfund.org.uk\)](#)

SG, SoAS – Monthly lectures are online on Youtube channel. Most recent one has seen 2,500 downloads/views. Update on purchase of building in central Edinburgh – have received funding from AHF and NLHF have appointed Horizons Research looking at what communities want to do with this building should they be able to purchase it. The space would be co-created with the community. Appointed a fundraising expert to help with the project. More info to follow. Expect Horizon to reach out to group for research. SoAS Lectures <https://www.youtube.com/@SocietyofAntiquariesofScotland/videos>

SMcG, PVOTAL – Working with CIOB looking at skills shortages and retrofit/regeneration. Looking at heritage through parliamentary working groups. New area – timber industries. Working with Napier University exploring new timber/bamboo composite. Conversations with Historic England re consultation – rural homes being left out of the retrofit revolution, and how to accommodate these buildings. Working with this company re ASHP

Historic Environment Working Group (HEWG)

Meeting Note 22nd February 2024

<https://www.heliotherm.com/> and Thermsaver (part of the Procast Group) looking at develop a new type of ASHP that is targeted at the hardest to treat Multi storey and Tenement Flats.

IB, Chair – Tourism and Hospitality skills group now has HE firmly on its radar. HES will be presenting the SIP to the group, highlighting the overlap. HES Assets Committee – committee continues to find its feet as a critical friend and interface with the Board to consider more focused aspects of asset management. Transparency, notes, and papers are meant to be public as per other board materials, but they haven't been published yet. IB to press for this. The assets committee has met 3 times, second meeting considered PICs, recent meeting considered the archives. Issues here are the lack of visibility as to what archives encompass (which in reality is the entirety the knowledge management system). Perhaps needs a new title? Flagging up challenges around IT systems. Next meeting to look at collections. Continued development within operational team of a PIC strategy; recent project plan went to the Board.

AM asks re transparency for HES board meetings and minutes.

JC notes Dictionary of Scottish Architects, finding it hit and miss.

IB to follow up both areas.

5. [Delivering net zero for Scotland's buildings - Heat in Buildings Bill: consultation](#)

Update of Scottish Government engagement so far and group discussion of key points.

Overview of BEFS view:

- High number of engagement meetings with SG throughout the consultation period.
- BEFS has a strong view on the proposed Heat in Buildings Bill and is prepared to state that this legislation is not fit for purpose. The auditor general report on decarbonising homes also highlights these questions, and that there is too much uncertainty to drive this forward.
- Questions around where exemptions lie, in relation to traditional buildings, none of the proposals mention fabric first or maintenance.
- As it stands it is unlikely to give the benefit financially or in terms of comfort to occupants that it is proposing.
- Whilst we are answering the questions we cannot support the legislation. There is an understanding internally withing SG that this is not the strongest piece of legislation.

Views from the group:

JC, AHSS - Was at the meeting. JC congratulates AM on how the points above were made to SG.

SG came back with comments about how this would sit in secondary legislation.

The HiB is dealing with residential properties, and aspirations good but leaving aside things that SG doesn't have any access or recourse to, including energy bills etc.

EPC reform should come first.

Objectives are fine, is all change being placed being placed on non-domestic properties?

Historic Environment Working Group (HEWG)

Meeting Note 22nd February 2024

AM, BEFS – There has been one meeting focussing on non-domestic, but ranges from football stadiums to churches. One of the challenges that hadn't been considered was the third or charitable sectors that only have one year funding; how to afford this? Long term planning for interventions is not something that had been considered.

The way the paper is constructed doesn't show that non-domestic properties are being taken into account.

DH, NTS – 2028 is the date given for compliance with EPC standard. Where will money come from, and will it really only cost 15K per property? Not attempting to apply EPC to non-domestic properties (stadiums etc) is good news. However not likely to see a Scottish level review of EPC.

District heating – if this is planned for you don't have to make adaptations – but the recent conversation of hospitality business MoMu – same as with tenements - how do you get agreement?

AM, BEFS – There is no clarity on what the baseline would be for measuring, so how to check improvements.

JL, ALGO – Support of scheme is a given, but concerned re physical impacts. Centre of town – archaeological impacts and environmental impacts. Is this the place to raise them?

AM, BEFS – This should hopefully have been captured by LHEES plans. LAs setting out where local heat networks could be. Can raise whether this dissemination has happened. Local Heat Networks expected to do a lot of the heavy lifting.

BEFS will be able to circulate draft response to Members, happy to take further views, comments and clarifications on BEFS response.

--

Next HEWG:

15th May 2024

10am – 12pm online